OPPORTUNITY INSIGHTS

The Geography of Upward Mobility in Albuquerque

Combining Big Data with Local Insights

The Fading American Dream

Percent of Children Earning More than Their Parents, by Year of Birth

Y-axis: Percent of Children Earning more than their Parents

X-axis: Child's Year of Birth

OPPORTUNITY INSIGHTS

Opportunity Insights' Policy Focus Areas with Communities

Reducing Segregation

Help Low-Income Families Move to High-Opportunity Areas

Place-Based Investments

Increase Upward Mobility in Low-Opportunity Areas

Improving Higher Education

Amplify Impacts of Colleges on Mobility

The Geography of Upward Mobility

Mean Household Income at Age 35 for Children with Parents Earning $27,000 (25th Percentile)

Racine $26k

Lansing $26k

Detroit $21k

Rochester $24k

Newark $27k

Dayton $22k

Cincinnati $21k

Albuquerque $30k

Tulsa $28k

New Orleans $24k

Legend: <$27.3k — $33.8k — >$45.7k

Subgroup Scaling, Low-Income, All Races | City Boundaries

OPPORTUNITY INSIGHTS

Metro Area Job Growth Does Not Directly Predict Upward Mobility

High mobility, low growth

High mobility, high growth

San Francisco

Minneapolis

New York

Seattle

Washington

Pittsburgh

Los Angeles

Denver

San Diego

Houston

Philadelphia

Portland

Riverside

Kansas City

Chicago

Miami

Dallas

Phoenix

Baltimore

St. Louis

Detroit

Cleveland

● **Albuquerque**

Low mobility, low growth

Cincinnati

Tampa

Low mobility, high growth

Atlanta

Income at Age 35 of Children from Low-Income Families

$38k
$36k
$34k
$32k
$30k
$28k

Job Growth 1990-2010 (%)

-20   0   20   40   60

Metropolitan Statistical Areas (MSAs)

OPPORTUNITY INSIGHTS

Two Americas: The Geography of Upward Mobility For Black vs. White Men

Average Income at Age 35 For Men Whose Parents Earned $27,000 (25th percentile)

Black Men

Seattle $18k
Detroit $17k
Boston $24k
Newark $19k
Charlotte $18k
Albuquerque $20k
Tulsa $20k

White Men

Seattle $28k
Detroit $23k
Boston $30k
Newark $35k
Charlotte $26k
Albuquerque $27k
Tulsa $31k

$17k $25k $35k

Individual Income | National Scaling, Low-Income, Black Men vs. White Men | City Boundaries

OPPORTUNITY INSIGHTS

Black Boys Growing up in High-Income Families Face Downward Mobility

Income Mobility for Black vs. White Men Raised in High-Income Families

Graphic made in collaboration with The Upshot at The New York Times

OPPORTUNITY INSIGHTS

Black Men Experience Higher Rates of Incarceration Than Their White Peers

Male Incarceration Rates Versus Parent Income

Black Men

White Men

Incarceration Rate (%)

Parent Household Income Percentile

OPPORTUNITY INSIGHTS

Low-Income Children in Albuquerque Grow Up to Make Less As Adults than the National Median

Children raised in Albuquerque by families earning less than $27,000 grow up to earn an average of about **$30,000 as adults**. This is **lower** than the national median of **$34,000.**

Subgroup Scaling, Low-Income, All Races

OPPORTUNITY INSIGHTS

Mobility Estimates for Low-Income Children from Albuquerque

- This map shows us the outcomes of children who grew up in Albuquerque in low-income families, **compared to the outcomes of all other children from low-income families nationally.**

- The outcomes for low-income children in Albuquerque are low compared to the national median, although outcomes are better for children growing up in the northeast of the city.

<$16k 25k 28k 30k 32k 34k 36k 38k 41k 45k >$60k

Subgroup Scaling, Low-Income, All Races

OPPORTUNITY INSIGHTS

Tracts Producing Better Outcomes for Low-Income Children
Adult Household Incomes for Children Raised in Low-Income Families in Albuquerque, NM

Neighborhood Statistics

<$16k 25k 28k 30k 32k 34k 36k 38k 41k 45k >$60k

Subgroup Scaling, Low-Income, All Races

OPPORTUNITY INSIGHTS

Visualizing Albuquerque's Racial Composition

Legend:
- White
- Black
- Asian
- Hispanic

OPPORTUNITY INSIGHTS

The Average Adult Income of Children Who Grew Up in Bernalillo County Varies Significantly By Race

Average Income at Age 35 of Children From Low-income Families

| | Asian | Black | Hispanic | Native American | White | National |

OPPORTUNITY INSIGHTS

Disparities by Parental Income in Albuquerque Extend Beyond Earnings

		Children from Low-Income Families*	Children from High-Income Families*
💵	Annual Household Income	**$30k**	**$46k**
🎓	College Graduation Rate	**19%**	**44%**
🔲	Incarceration Rate	**2.2%**	**0.6%**
👶	Teen Birth Rate	**29%**	**15%**

* Low-income refers to 25th percentile (below $27,000), High-income refers 75th percentile (above $94,000).

OPPORTUNITY INSIGHTS

Every Year of Exposure to a Higher Opportunity Neighborhood Pays Off

Potential Income Gained from Moving to a Better Neighborhood, by Age

S Y Jackson, Albuquerque

South Los Altos, Albuquerque

Average Income at Age 35

$32K
$28K
$24K
$20K

Age of Child when Parents Move

2
10
20
28

OPPORTUNITY INSIGHTS

Two Approaches to Increasing Upward Mobility in Neighborhoods

- **Reducing Segregation**: Increase Access to High-Opportunity Areas by Providing Affordable Housing

- **Place-Based Investments**: Invest in Low-Opportunity Neighborhoods to Increase Upward Mobility

Two Approaches to Increasing Upward Mobility in Neighborhoods

- **Reducing Segregation**: Increase Access to High-Opportunity Areas by Providing Affordable Housing

- **Place-Based Investments**: Invest in Low-Opportunity Neighborhoods to Increase Upward Mobility

All LIHTC Developments in Albuquerque

$60k + $34k   < $16k

Subgroup Scaling, Low-Income, All Races | Census Tracts

OPPORTUNITY INSIGHTS

All HCV-Occupied Units in Albuquerque

$60k + \quad\quad $34k \quad\quad < $16k

Subgroup Scaling, Low-Income, All Races | Census Tracts

OPPORTUNITY INSIGHTS

Two Approaches to Increasing Upward Mobility in Neighborhoods

- **Reducing Segregation**: Increase Access to High-Opportunity Areas by Providing Affordable Housing

- **Place-Based Investments**: Invest in Low-Opportunity Neighborhoods to Increase Upward Mobility

OPPORTUNITY INSIGHTS

National Characteristics of Higher Opportunity Neighborhoods

More Stable Family Structure

Lower Neighborhood Poverty Rate

Better School Quality

Greater Social Capital

These four **neighborhood variables** are among the strongest correlates **related to upward mobility** in the country. They are not necessarily causal factors, but they do give us a sense of what higher mobility neighborhoods tend to look like.

All U.S. Census Tracts

OPPORTUNITY INSIGHTS

Discussion Questions

- What do you think explains the variation in outcomes in Albuquerque by neighborhood? By race?

- What levers exist at the city and community level to improve neighborhood conditions for the children growing up in them?

- How might these maps influence your efforts to improve economic mobility?

OPPORTUNITY INSIGHTS

Univ. of New Mexico Has Higher Access But Lower Success Than the Nation

Mobility Rates: Success Rate Versus Access Rate by Institution

Success
Percent of Students from Bottom 20% who Reach Top 20%

100

75

50

25

0

University of New Mexico

Have not attended college

0   20   40   60

Access
Percent of Students from Families in Bottom 20%

OPPORTUNITY INSIGHTS

Most NM Institutions Have High Access Rates Compared to the Nation

Mobility Rates: Success Rate Versus Access Rate by Institution, New Mexico Schools Highlighted

Success
Percent of Students from Bottom 20% who Reach Top 20%

100

75

50 — — — New Mexico Institute of Mining & Technology

25

New Mexico Junior College
University of New Mexico

Central New Mexico Community College

0 — — — New Mexico Military Institute

0   20   40   60

Access
Percent of Students from Families in Bottom 20%

▶ To All Schools

OPPORTUNITY INSIGHTS

New Mexico Junior College Has the Best Mobility Rate in the State
Mobility Rates: Success Rate Versus Access Rate by Institution, New Mexico Schools Highlighted

Community Colleges In Blue

Success
Percent of Students from Bottom 20% who Reach Top 20%

100

75

50

25

0

New Mexico Junior College

Central New Mexico Community College

New Mexico Military Institute

0   20   40   60

Access
Percent of Students from Families in Bottom 20%

OPPORTUNITY INSIGHTS

NM Institute of Mining & Technology Outpaces Peers on This Measure

Mobility Rates: Success Rate Versus Access Rate by Institution, New Mexico Schools Highlighted

Alternate Measure of Success
Percent of Students from Bottom 20% who Reach Top 60%

100

75

50

25

0

New Mexico Institute of Mining & Technology

University of New Mexico

New Mexico Junior College

New Mexico Military Institute

Central New Mexico Community College

Have not attended college

0   20   40   60

Access
Percent of Students from Families in Bottom 20%

To All Schools

OPPORTUNITY INSIGHTS

Discussion Questions

- What do you think explains the differences in outcomes across institutions?

- What opportunities do you have to connect your workforce efforts to educational pathways in the region?

- What role might your higher education partners and/or employers play in this work?

OPPORTUNITY INSIGHTS

Economic Opportunity Becomes Newsworthy

A Wake-Up Call for Charlotte-Mecklenburg

January 25, 2014

Land of opportunity? Not by a long shot

Charlotte is nation's worst big city for climbing out of poverty

The Charlotte Observer

Over the last several decades, Charlotte-Mecklenburg has transformed from a small southern town to one of the country's largest and most dynamic communities. We continue to attract people—nearly 50 a day— who move here to take advantage of our strong business climate, favorable weather and geographic location, and our reputation as a great place to live and raise a family. Accolades from the outside regularly tell us how tall we stand among other communities. As recently as February 7, 2017, U.S. News and World Report ranked us as the 14th best place to live in the country.[i]

Yet, in 2013 when the headline broke about the Harvard University/UC Berkeley study that ranked Charlotte-Mecklenburg 50th out of 50 in upward mobility[ii] for children born into our lowest income quintile, many in our community responded with disbelief. **How, on the one hand, can we be such a vital and opportunity-rich community, and on the other, be ranked dead last in the odds that our lowest income children and youth will be able to move up the economic ladder as they become adults?**

Subgroup Scaling, Low-Income, All Races | Census Tracts

OPPORTUNITY INSIGHTS

Charlotte Opportunity System Strategy
For Children, Youth, and Families

- **Cross-Cutting Factors**
  1. Segregation
  2. Social Capital

- **Key Determinants**
  1. Early Care and Education
  2. College and Career Readiness
  3. Child and Family Stability

Social Capital

Early Care & Education

College & Career Readiness

The Impact of Segregation

Social Capital

Family & Child Stability

Social Capital

OPPORTUNITY INSIGHTS

Local Partner Efforts in Charlotte

- The United Way of Central Carolinas aligned the economic mobility report with **$13 million** of investments

- Mecklenburg County and MECK Pre-K increased the early care budget by **$15 million**, added 33 new Pre-K classrooms serving an additional 600 children

- The City of Charlotte increased affordable housing bonds **from $15 to $50 million**, with Mayor Lyles, City Council, and voters' support

- The Foundation for the Carolinas invested **$5 million** in affordable housing and raised a total of **$31 million** of private sector funds to support affordable housing

OPPORTUNITY INSIGHTS

Discussion Questions

- How does the city build the political will to tackle difficult challenges?

- How might these data be helpful in raising awareness around needed policy change?

OPPORTUNITY INSIGHTS

Appendix

Geographies of Analysis
Example: Albuquerque

Albuquerque

Metropolitan Service Area (MSA)

- MSAs have high population density at their center and close economic ties throughout the area

- Defined by the U.S. Office of Management and Budget

Commuting Zone (CZ)

- CZs combine counties to more closely reflect the ties between employers and labor supply.

- Defined by the U.S. Department of Agriculture

City Boundary

- City limits are typically determined by ordinance, state charter, or statute.

OPPORTUNITY INSIGHTS

Opportunity Insights' Data Sources:

- Federal Income Tax Returns for **1989**, **1994**, **1995**, and **1995-2015**
- Decennial Census Short Form for **2000** and **2010**
- Decennial Census Long Form for **2000**
- American Community Survey for **2005-2015**

- These data have all been combined into our tool called the Opportunity Atlas

Outcome Methodology:

- "Adult Household Income" refers to the current average income (in $) of children raised in low-income families, who are now adults. This adult income is estimated in 2013-2018 for the cohort of low-income American children who were born in 1978-1983. The percentile rankings we report throughout this presentation are calculated across whichever selection is made within the Opportunity Atlas. Selection options include:
  - All low-income children nationally
  - Low-income children of a specific race
  - Low-income children of a specific gender

- Note: The Opportunity Atlas does allow us to look at the outcomes of children raised in middle- and high-income families, but here we focus of low-income children in order to measure upward mobility.

OPPORTUNITY INSIGHTS

How Our Data Reflect Current Conditions

- On average, the long-run mobility outcomes for people born around 1980 are **strong predictors** of medium-run mobility outcomes for people born around 1990.

- Outcomes from the 1980 group are **better predictors** for the more recent generation's trends than other observable tract characteristics like the poverty rate or unemployment rate.

- Though gentrifying neighborhoods will see changes in current characteristics (higher rents, higher household incomes, etc.), the **outcomes of original residents will not necessarily improve.**

- Places that produce good outcomes tend to **continue to do so a decade later**.

- Our opportunity measure is a much better predictor of outcomes than poverty rates or tests scores.

- Our data should be combined with **additional analyses** and **on-the-ground knowledge** in areas that have changed substantially

OPPORTUNITY INSIGHTS

Albuquerque's City Council District Boundaries

District 5
Councilor Borrego

District 4
Councilor Winter

District
Councilor Jones

District 1
Councilor Sanchez

District 9
Councilor Harris

District 3
Councilor Peña

District 7
Councilor Gibson

District 2
Councilor Benton

District 6
Councilor Davis

Subgroup Scaling, Low-Income, All Races

OPPORTUNITY
INSIGHTS

Those Who Leave Albuquerque's CZ Have Higher Outcomes on Average

Legend:
- Everyone raised in the CZ
- Left the CZ
- Stayed in the CZ

Y-axis: Adult Income at Age 35 for Children of Parents in Each Income Group

	Low-Income Parents (25th Percentile)	Middle Income Parents (50th Percentile)	High Income Parents (75th Percentile)
Everyone raised in the CZ	$29,051	$39,477	$49,694
Left the CZ	$33,147	$47,440	$59,893
Stayed in the CZ	$27,925	$36,318	$44,703

OPPORTUNITY INSIGHTS

How the Geographic Mobility Out of Albuquerque's CZ Compares Nationally

Legend:
- ■ National Median
- ■ Median within Albuquerque

Y-axis: Percent of Population Staying in CZ in Which They Were Raised (0 to 100)

Low-Income Parents (25th Percentile): National Median 74%, Median within Albuquerque 76%

Middle Income Parents (50th Percentile): National Median 69%, Median within Albuquerque 69%

High Income Parents (75th Percentile): National Median 65%, Median within Albuquerque 62%

OPPORTUNITY INSIGHTS

Cluster of Higher-Opportunity Tracts

	High Opp Tracts 1990	High Opp Tracts 2000	High Opp Tracts 2010	High Opp Tracts 2017	All ALBQ 1990	All ALBQ 2000	All ALBQ 2010	All ALBQ 2017
Household Income*	$70K	$64K	$58K	$58K	$52K	$55K	$54K	$49K
% Hispanic	18%	23%	28%	31%	26%	34%	42%	45%
Poverty Rate	6%	9%	9%	12%	10%	11%	13%	15%
% Single Parents	24%	37%	38%	40%	25%	37%	38%	41%
College Grad Rate	35%	36%	36%	42%	28%	30%	30%	32%

*of current residents

Return to Presentation ▶

OPPORTUNITY INSIGHTS

Collegiate Leaders in Increasing Mobility

CLIMB is a **partnership** between Opportunity Insights and **400 colleges** across the U.S. that seeks to help colleges improve the economic mobility of their students by:

- Increasing access to low-income students to college

- Ensuring the success of students from disadvantaged backgrounds at college

The CLIMB Network's Current Members
CLIMB Currently Includes 422 Colleges That Collectively Serve More Than 5.2 million students

State system participating

Parent Incomes and Student Outcomes
Measuring the Economic Mobility of Colleges

Use attendance and income data on all college students from 1999-2013 from Treasury and Dept. of Education

- **Parents:** Measure household incomes when students are teenagers

- **Students:** Measure earnings in the mid-30s for <u>enrolled</u> students

Rank students and parents relative to others in the same cohort

OPPORTUNITY INSIGHTS

Mobility Rates – A Product of College Success and College Access
Measuring the Economic Mobility of Colleges

A college's *mobility rate* is the fraction of its students who come from bottom fifth **and** end up in top fifth, this can be broken down into two key components:

Access rate – fraction of students who come from the bottom fifth ($25,000 and below in household income)

Success rate – fraction of students from the bottom fifth who make it to the top fifth ($58,000 and above in individual income)

Mobility Rate = Access x Success

2%   =   13.6% x   15%

University of New Mexico

Using a Different Benchmark for College Success
Measuring the Impact of Colleges in Moving Students to the Top 3 Quintiles

Alternative Success rate – fraction of students from the bottom fifth ($25,000 and below in household income) who make it to the top 3 quintiles or the top 60% ($31,000 and above in individual income) of the income distribution.

Under this measure the mobility and access rate of the University of New Mexico would change to be:

Mobility Rate = Access x Success

7.8%   =   13.6% x   57.1%

University of New Mexico

OPPORTUNITY INSIGHTS

All Area Institutions Have Lower Access Rates Compared to the Nation
Mobility Rates: Success Versus Access Rate by Institution, New Mexico Schools Highlighted

Success
Percent of Students from Bottom 20% who Reach Top 20%

100

75

50

25

0

New Mexico Institute Of Mining
University Of New Me:
New Mexico State Univ
New Mexico Junior Col
San Juan College
New Mexico Highlands U
Western New Mexico Un
Eastern New Mexico Uni
Clovis Community Col
Santa Fe Community Co
Central New Mexico Commun
Luna Community Coll
Santa Fe University Of Art A
Olympian Academy Of Cos
New Mexico Military Ins

0   20   40   60

Access
Percent of Students from Families in Bottom 20%

Back to Presentation

OPPORTUNITY INSIGHTS

Access and Success at Select New Mexico Institutions
Ordered by Mobility Rate

College	Access Rate	Success Rate	Mobility Rate
New Mexico Junior College	22 %	19.7 %	4.3 %
New Mexico Institute Of Mining & Technology	8.4 %	47.7 %	4 %
University Of New Mexico	13.6 %	15 %	2 %
New Mexico Military Institute	8.4 %	0.3 %	0.03 %
National Average	12.5 %	19.6 %	2.5%
New Mexico Average	19.3 %	12.5%	2.2%

Low-Income Student Access Has Slightly Decreased Over the Last Decade

Higher Education Access in the Albuquerque CZ and in New Mexico, 2000-2010

New Mexico Average Access

Albuquerque Average Access

National Average Access

Access
Percent of Students from Bottom 20%

25
20
15
10
5
0

2000
2005
2010

Cohort
Year in which students were Age 20 attending a college or university

OPPORTUNITY INSIGHTS

Top 10 Colleges in America – By Mobility Rate
Fraction of Bottom-to-Top Success Stories

College	Mobility Rate
Cal State-Los Angeles	9.9%
Pace University	8.4%
SUNY-Stony Brook	8.4%
Technical Career Institutes	8.0%
U. Texas-Pan American	7.6%
CUNY System	7.2%
Glendale Comm. Coll.	7.1%
South Texas College	6.9%
Cal State Poly-Pomona	6.8%
U. Texas-El Paso	6.8%
Ivy Plus Colleges	2.2%
Avg. College in the U.S.	1.9%

OPPORTUNITY INSIGHTS

Using a Different Benchmark for College Success
Measuring the Impact of Colleges in Moving Students to the Top 3 Quintiles

Alternative Success rate – fraction of students from the bottom fifth ($25,000 and below in household income) who make it to the top 3 quintiles or the top 60% ($31,000 and above in individual income) of the income distribution.

Under this measure the mobility and access rate of the University of New Mexico would change to be:

Mobility Rate = Access x Success

7.8%   =   13.6% x   57.1%

University of New Mexico

New Mexico Institutions' Role in Moving Students to the Middle Class

Mobility Rates: Success Versus Access Rate by Institution, New Mexico Schools Highlighted

Alternate Measure of Success
Percent of Students from Bottom 20% who Reach Top 60%

Labeled institutions (right side):
- New Mexico Institute Of Mining
- New Mexico State Univ
- New Mexico Highlands U
- New Mexico Junior Col
- Western New Mexico Un
- Santa Fe Community Co
- University Of New Mex
- New Mexico Military Ins
- Santa Fe University Of Art Ar
- Clovis Community Col
- San Juan College
- Eastern New Mexico Uni
- Luna Community Coll
- Central New Mexico Commun
- Olympian Academy Of Cos

Access
Percent of Students from Families in Bottom 20%

Back to Presentation

OPPORTUNITY INSIGHTS