



Landmarks & Urban  
Conservation Commission



**Agenda Number: 5**  
**Case No.: 17-LUCC-50029**  
**Project # 1011279**  
**July 12, 2017**

### *Staff Report*

<b>Agent</b>		<b>Staff Recommendation</b> <i>APPROVAL of Case # 17-LUCC-50029, Project #1011279, a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for new construction and restoration based on the Findings beginning on page 9 and subject to the Conditions of Approval on page 10.</i>
<b>Applicant</b>	Kenneth Sandoval	
<b>Request</b>	Certificate of Appropriateness for new construction & restoration	
<b>Legal Description</b>	Tract 153, Block 0000	
<b>Address/Location</b>	2004 Old Town Road NW	
<b>Size</b>	0.07 ac.	
<b>Zoning</b>	H-1	
<b>Historic Location</b>	Old Town Historic Zone	<b>Leslie Naji, Senior Planner</b> <b>Staff Planner</b>

### **Summary of Analysis**

*The application is for a Certificate of Appropriateness to restore parts of a 1910 adobe house, remodel a 1940's addition to the rear and remove and replace a 1970's bathroom addition. The applicant also proposes a 42" high adobe wall to provide a courtyard space. The form and architectural style of the new buildings are common to the H-1 Historic Zone with pitched roofs and corrugated metal roofing material.*

*Although not planned for construction at this time, the applicant has included plans for a future addition to the property, providing plans and elevations for two studio apartments to be added later. These are also reviewed for compliance.*

*This request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for alteration has been reviewed against the Old Town Historic Zone Development Guidelines and the criteria for approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness contained in the LUC Ordinance. The applicant's proposal complies with the development guidelines and is eligible for a Certificate of Appropriateness.*

**PRIMARY REFERENCES:**

*Landmarks and Urban Conservation Ordinance; Design Guidelines for the Old Town Historic Zone.*

***Development Review Division Report:***

**SUMMARY OF REQUEST**

<b><i>Requests</i></b>	<i>Certificate of Appropriateness for alteration</i>
<b><i>Historic Location</i></b>	<i>Old Town Historic Zone</i>

**AREA HISTORY AND CHARACTER**

***Surrounding architectural styles, historic character and recent (re)development***

	<b><i># of Stories</i></b>	<b><i>Roof Configuration, Architectural Style and Approximate Age of Construction</i></b>	<b><i>Historic Classification &amp; Land Use</i></b>
<b><i>General Area</i></b>	1-2	Flat; Pitched (gabled and hipped), Carpenter Gothic, Spanish-Pueblo Revival and contemporary interpretations; Territorial Revival, Brick Commercial, 1796 – 1990’s.	Contributing, Unclassified Residential and Commercial
<b><i>Site to the North</i></b>	1	Southwest Revival, flat roof, adobe, crenelated parapet, 1924	Unclassified
<b><i>Sites to the South</i></b>	1	Parking lot San Felipe School	Unclassified
<b><i>Sites to the East</i></b>	1	New Mexico Vernacular, hipped roof, adobe, galvanized metal roof, 1930’s	Contributing
<b><i>Site to the West</i></b>	1	Spanish Pueblo, flat roof, projecting vigas, adobe, c. 1870	Contributing

**II. INTRODUCTION**

***Proposal***

The request is for a Certificate of Appropriateness to restore a small 1910 adobe house, remove a poorly constructed 1970’s bathroom addition, remodel and restore a 1950’s rear addition, and add a new bathroom incorporated into the rear. The entire structure will be reroofed, incorporating the style and pitch of the new roof of the rear addition with the original 1919 roof. New roofing material will be corrugated metal similar to the original.

The proposal includes a stabilized exposed adobe wall to create a courtyard space and a continuation of the wall to the east which will mark the entrances to future studio units. The proposed future units consist of stucco block walls, aluminum clad single hung windows with painted wood trim and a corrugated metal roof with side gabled end, pitch to match original structure. The studio units also incorporate stuccoed dormers.

***Context***

The Historic Old Town Zone encompasses an area roughly between Mountain Road and Central Ave. on the north and south, and Rio Grande Blvd. and the 19<sup>th</sup> St. on the west and east. The historic zone was created with the adoption of the City's first zoning Code in 1959 to preserve and promote the educational, cultural and general welfare of the public through the preservation of protection of the traditional architectural character of historic old Albuquerque.

The Spanish Colonial, Territorial or Western Victorian architectural styles of buildings and structures erected prior to 1912 in the area now constituted as the State of New Mexico, comprise the traditional architectural character of the H-1 Zone.

Inside this historic zone is the state registered "Old Albuquerque Historic District". The Old Albuquerque Historic District is a sub-set of the Old Town Historic Zone. The historic district is the core of the Hispano village of Albuquerque, founded in 1706, and the main village in the area until the arrival of the railroad in 1880. The church and plaza are at the center of the district, as in most Hispanic villages of New Mexico.

Of the buildings in the district, only San Felipe de Neri church can be shown to date to the Spanish Colonial period. A few buildings may be in whole or in part from the early nineteenth century, but the majority of the buildings in Old Albuquerque Historic District were built between 1870 and 1900.

Almost every building has seen some degree of remodeling, resulting from the area's growth as a tourist-oriented commercial center after 1940. Old Albuquerque became "Old Town", a district of shops, boutiques, galleries and restaurants. Many buildings acquired Pueblo Revival portals, protruding false vigas and other stylistic elements thought to be conducive to a tourist atmosphere.

### ***History***

The 1913 Sanborn map first shows the property, labeled as adobe/earth roof. It remains as such until the 1931 Sanborn which shows a covered porch which, by 1942 was shown as an enclosed addition, that which is to be renovated. The only other changes to the property include the addition of a bathroom, dating to the 1970's.

Little has changed with the property which has a large side yard enclosed with a chain-link fence. Original door and front window are to be replaced with in kind units although original trim and framing is to be restored.

## ***APPLICABLE PLANS, ORDINANCES, DESIGN GUIDELINES & POLICIES***

### ***III. ANALYSIS***

Policies are written in regular text and staff analysis and comment in bold italic print.

#### ***Comprehensive Zoning Code***

The Old Town Historic Zone was designated in 1959 with the adoption of the first Zoning Code for the City of Albuquerque. Old Town was recognized even then as a very special location

within Albuquerque, and the H-1 Zone was designated specifically to address the development within Old Town. The H-1 Zone was later amended to include a 300 foot "buffer" zone surrounding Old Town to ensure a coherent visual character for the surrounding neighborhood. Signage, architectural style, and permissive uses are controlled through the H-1 Zoning. The code provides for Certificates of Appropriateness for development with the H-1 and the Buffer zones. Relevant sections of the H-1 Zone (§14-16-2-25, R.O.A., 1994) are attached.

Any construction, alteration or demolition, which would affect the exterior appearance of any structure within said Overlay Zone, shall not be undertaken until the Landmarks and Urban Conservation Commission has approved a Certificate of Appropriateness. The Code also provides that the adopted specific development guidelines may provide exemptions to the requirement or provide for City staff approval in lieu of Landmarks and Urban Conservation Commission approval. Procedures relating to the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness are prescribed in Chapter 14, Article 12, Landmarks and Urban Conservation.

***The zoning regulations for the H-1 zone limit the height of buildings to 26 feet. No minimum setbacks are required. A floor area ratio of .75 is permitted and the new development meets this maximum ratio. Zoning regulations for walls along the front property line are limited to 36". The proposed 42" wall will require an exception.***

***An analysis of the proposal's conformance with the adopted specific development guidelines is provided below.***

#### ***Development Guidelines for the Old Town Historic Zone***

Design Guidelines (as amended through April 9, 1998) have been adopted by the Landmarks and Urban Conservation Commission for building projects in the H-1 Historic Old Town Zone. The Specific Design Guidelines for the Old Town Historic District also apply to the buffer zone within 300 feet of the historic district. The Guidelines are general, and along with standards applicable to the rehabilitation of historic properties, they address contemporary new buildings and pedestrian safety.

1. Every reasonable effort should be made to provide a compatible use for buildings which will require minimum alteration to the building and its environment.

***The proposal restores one of the few early buildings in Old Town to original standards. In addition, the proposed addition is in keeping with the original architecture.***

2. Rehabilitation work should not destroy the distinguishing qualities or character of the property and its environment. The removal or alteration of any historic material or architectural features should be held to the minimum, consistent with the proposed use.

***Although the original window and door are to be replaced, they are to match the original. Existing framing and detailing is to remain.***

3. Deteriorated architectural features should be repaired rather than replaced, wherever possible. In the event replacement is necessary, the new material should match the material being replaced in composition, design, color, texture, and other visual qualities. Repair or replacement of missing

architectural features should be based on accurate duplications of original features, substantiated by physical or pictorial evidence rather than on conjectural designs of the availability of different architectural features from other buildings.

*Although there are few details to this property, the restoration of the original door transom and the curved window opening will bring back original elements.*

4. Distinctive stylistic features or examples of skilled craftsmanship which characterize older structure and often predate the mass production of building materials should be treated with sensitivity.

*Not Applicable*

5. Many changes to buildings and environments which have taken place in the course of time are evidence of the history of the building and the neighborhood. These changes may have developed significance in their own right, and this significance should be recognized and respected.

*The rear addition dating back to the 1930's is to be restored; whereas an addition from the 1970's will be removed.*

6. All buildings should be recognized as products of their own time. Alterations to create an appearance inconsistent with the actual character of the building should be discouraged.

*This property makes no pretense of being anything other than a simple adobe house.*

7. The design and general appearance of any development or alteration in the Old Town Historic Zone should be limited to the range of design options possible and commonly chosen in Albuquerque prior to the opening of the Santa Fe Railroad in April 1880. The design of any alteration to currently existing structures erected between 1880 and 1912 should be limited to the range of design options possible and commonly chosen at the time of the building's construction.

*The proposed addition, change of roof and new construction of the future project are all compatible with Old Town architectural styles for residential architecture of the early 1900's*

8. Contemporary design for new buildings and additions to existing buildings or landscaping in the 300 foot transition zone surrounding the Old Town Historic Zone should not be discouraged if such design is compatible with the size, scale, color, material, and character of the neighborhood, buildings, or its environment.

*Not Applicable*

9. Wherever possible, new additions or alterations to buildings should be done in such a manner that if they were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the original building would be unimpaired.

*The proposed new construction is independent of the original structure.*

10. Every effort should be made to safeguard the public welfare along vehicular and pedestrian traffic ways. Placement of walls, building projections, fences, planters, shrubs, signs, ramps, steps, etc. should

be planned and positioned so that they do not present a potential hazard. Provisions for the handicapped should be planned so that the essential character of the property is not damaged.

*The proposed courtyard wall is shown in two different locations. As a projecting wall, there is not sufficient sidewalk clearance and vehicular viewpoints might be obstructed. Placement of the wall flush with the front face of the existing house will better address the need of public safety.*

11. Any security device that prevents major features of doors and windows such as ornament, panels, glass panes, and mullions from being seen are prohibited.

*Not Applicable*

12. Property owners are considering installing security devices are urged to contact LUCC staff for advice and a free handout on how to increase security without detracting from the historic character of a building.

*Not Applicable*

13. An application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for work which does not require any type of building or construction permit may be approved by staff.

*The new buildings are designed in vernacular styles, with a pitched roof of galvanized metal. The building will have stucco finish exterior and windows with 1/1 lights and wood exterior trim. The design and scale of the new buildings are similar to the majority of buildings in the H-1 Historic Zone.*

*The drawings submitted for this project are illustrative; heights of major features are not given, nor are rear elevations shown. The front adobe wall, as previously mentioned, is indicated to be extended towards the street. This would prohibit vehicular view and encroach upon the narrow sidewalk area. Subsequent drawings for building permit should be provided for staff review and official LUCC records.*

### **Landmarks and Urban Conservation Ordinance**

This site consists of a contributing property in the Old Town Historic Zone and the project is subject to certain provisions of the Landmarks and Urban Conservation Ordinance (Article 12, R.O.A., 1994). The purpose of this ordinance is to:

*“Preserve, protect, enhance, perpetuate and promote the use of structures and areas of historical, cultural, architectural, engineering, archeological or geographic significance located in the city; to strengthen the city’s economic base by stimulating the tourist industry; to enhance the identity of the city by protecting the city’s heritage and prohibiting the unnecessary destruction or defacement of its cultural assets; and to conserve existing urban developments as viable economic and social entities.”*

Section 14-12-8 (A) of the LUC ordinance provides that:

---

*"Within the boundaries of a historic zone, urban conservation overlay zone, or landmark site, the exterior appearance of any structure shall not be altered, new structures shall not be constructed, and existing structures shall not be demolished until a Certificate of Appropriateness has been duly approved."*

Section 14-12-8 (A) of the LUC ordinance provides criteria for approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness:

§14-12-8-B- (1) The change is consistent with the designation ordinance and specific development guidelines for the historic overlay zone.

***As discussed in the analysis above, the development is consistent with the ordinance and the development guidelines.***

§14-12-8 (B) (2) The architectural character, historical value, or archaeological value of the structure or site itself or of any historic zone in which it is located will not be significantly impaired or diminished.

***The architectural character of the site or the historic zone will not be significantly impaired or diminished by the new development. The architectural style, materials and the scale of the building is similar to those found on other buildings in the historic zone.***

§14-12-8 (B) (3) The change qualified as a "certified rehabilitation: pursuant to the Tax Reform Act of 1976.

***Not applicable.***

§14-12-8 (B) (4) The structure or site's distinguished original qualities or character will not be altered. Original shall mean at the time of initial construction or developed over the course of history of the structure.

***The scale and design of the new building is compatible with the surroundings.***

§14-12-8 (B) (5) Deteriorated architectural features should be repaired rather than replaced, if possible. If replacement is necessary, the new material shall match the original as closely as possible in like material and design.

***Window and door trim details are to be repaired.***

§14-12-8 (B) (6) Additions to existing structure and new construction may be of contemporary design if such design is compatible with the historic zone in which it is to be located.

***New construction is compatible with the New Mexico vernacular of the original house..***

§14-12-8 (B) (7) Demolition shall only be permitted if it is determined that the property is incapable of producing a reasonable economic return as presently controlled and that no means of preserving the structure has been found. In making a determination regarding reasonable economic return the Commission may consider the estimated market value of the building, land and any proposed replacement structures, financial details of the property including, but not limited to income and expense statements, current mortgage balances and appraisals, the length of time that the property has been on the market for sale or lease, potential return based on projected future market conditions, the building's structural condition, and other items determined to be relevant to the application.

*Not applicable.*

### ***V. Neighborhood/Public Concerns***

The application was legally advertised in the newspaper. A sign was posted on the property with notice of the application and hearing date. The applicant notified the Historic Old Town Property Owners Association was notified of the request. No comments have been received regarding this application.

### ***Conclusions***

This request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for alteration has been reviewed against the *Old Town Historic Zone Development Guidelines* and the criteria for approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness contained in the *LUC Ordinance*. The restoration and new additions comply with both.



---

***FINDINGS for APPROVAL of a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for new construction - Case 17-LUCC-50029 / Project # 1011279 (July 12, 2017)***

1. This application is a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property described as Lot 153 of the Old Albuquerque Town site, MRGCD Map 38, in the Historic Old Town (H-1) Zone.
2. The subject property is approximately 0.07 acres and contains an existing building. It is listed as a contributing building in the state registered Old Albuquerque Historic District.
3. The proposal is to restore the existing one bedroom home while removing and replacing a later bathroom addition and to construct two new studio units connected to the east of the rear of the building. The currently proposed addition is 120sq.ft. bathroom and entry. A later addition will include two connected units of approximately 550sq.ft. each.
4. Section 14-16-2-25(D)(1) of the Comprehensive Zoning Code states “Any construction, modification, addition, alteration, moving or destruction which would affect the exterior appearance of any structure or place in the H-1 zone requires a Certificate of Appropriateness which must be approved by the Landmarks and Urban Conservation Commission.”
5. Section 14-12-8(A) of the Landmarks and Urban Conservation Ordinance states that within the boundaries of a historic zone, the exterior appearance of any structure shall not be altered, new structures shall not be constructed, and existing structures shall not be demolished until a Certificate of Appropriateness has been duly approved.
6. The LUC Ordinance specifies that an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness shall be approved if it complies with several specified criteria. The LUC Ordinance Section 14-12(8)(B)(1) states that a Certificate of Appropriateness shall be approved if “*The change is consistent with the designation ordinance and specific development guidelines for the landmark or historic zone*”. The proposed development is consistent with the designation ordinance and the guidelines. The buildings are designed in a manner that reflects architectural styles common to the H-1 Zone. The new buildings utilize traditional exterior materials.
7. The LUC Ordinance Section 14-12(8)(B)(2) states that a Certificate of Appropriateness shall be approved if “The architectural character, historical value, or archaeological value of the structure or site itself or of any historic zone or urban conservation overlay zone in which it is located will not be significantly impaired or diminished”. The architectural character of the H-1 Historic Zone will not be impaired or diminished by the proposed

---

development. The form and architectural style of the new buildings are common to the historic zone and compatible with the surroundings. Traditional exterior details and materials are used throughout.

***RECOMMENDATION - Case No. 17-LUCC-50029/ Project # 1011279***

**APPROVAL** of an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for alterations, renovation, and new construction located at the 2004 Old Town Road, described as Lot 153 of the Old Albuquerque Town site, zoned H-1 based on the above 7 Findings and subject to the following conditions.

**Conditions of Approval Recommended for 17-LUCC-50029/ Project # 1011279**

1. Applicant is responsible to acquire, and approval is contingent upon, approval of all applicable permits and related approvals, including but not limited to the additional front wall height requested.
  2. Applicant shall provide LUCC staff with floor plans and elevations as drawn for building permit.
  3. Final selection of windows are subject to LUCC staff review and approval.
  4. Front adobe courtyard wall shall be setback to align with front face of the existing house.
- 

\_\_\_\_\_  
**Leslie Naji, Senior Planner,**  
**Urban Design and Development Division**